Implementation and Impact of Hospital Bylaws in Indonesian Healthcare: A Scoping Review

Zulfa Nadia Danasti 1* , Qurratul Aini 1

Abstract
Background: Hospital bylaws are essential regulatory frameworks governing hospital operations and defining roles among medical staff, administrators, and owners. Effective implementation ensures compliance with legal standards and enhances patient safety. Method: This scoping review analyzed literature from 2003 to 2023 on hospital bylaw implementation in Indonesian hospitals. Data were gathered from PubMed, ScienceDirect, and Google Scholar using systematic searches and evaluated using Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines. Results: Out of 2,492 articles screened, 11 met inclusion criteria after quality assessment. Findings highlighted factors influencing bylaw implementation, including owner knowledge gaps, directorial roles in clinical management, and staff adherence to patient safety protocols. Challenges such as workload impact on safety practices were also noted. Conclusion: Effective hospital bylaw implementation in Indonesia hinges on collaborative efforts among stakeholders. Enhancing owner awareness, optimizing directorial roles, and fostering staff compliance are critical. Continuous evaluation and adaptation are necessary for sustained improvements in hospital governance and patient care.

Significance | This review identifies factors influencing bylaw implementation, enhancing hospital governance and patient safety in Indonesian healthcare settings.

1. Introduction
Hospital bylaws encompass a wide range of regulations and policies governing various aspects of hospital operations, including legislative mandates, procedural rules, and uniform standards. Narrowly defined, hospital bylaws specifically address the relationships and responsibilities between medical staff, hospital administrators, and hospital owners (Andriani, 2019). These bylaws, also referred to as hospital statutes or management regulations, are crucial for guiding the overall operations, setting objectives, and ensuring the effective functioning of the hospital (Aseweh Abor et al., 2008). The legal implications of hospital bylaws are multifaceted. Firstly, hospitals are mandated to establish comprehensive regulations. Secondly, these bylaws delineate the duties, functions, and authority of hospital owners, managers, and medical personnel. Thirdly, they underscore the hospital's commitment to good corporate and clinical governance (Riyana Dody Setiawan et al., n.d.). Effective hospital bylaws are also designed to provide legal protection for healthcare workers through mechanisms that address potential legal issues and enhance patient safety (Leana et al., 2017). Hospital bylaws function as binding agreements between the hospital and its medical staff, ensuring that operations are conducted under a shared understanding and adherence to agreed-upon rules (Paterick & Paterick, 2019). These regulations must be actively maintained and enforced to ensure compliance and the effective functioning of hospital services. Enforcement of hospital bylaws is akin to the implementation of any statutory regulation, requiring

Author Affiliation.
1 Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Bantul, Special Region of Yogyakarta, 55183, Indonesia.

Please cite this article.

http://dx.doi.org/10.25163/angiotherapy.859696 1-7 | ANGIOThERAPy | Published online May 21, 2024
diligent application and oversight (Ishaq, 2008).

The development and enforcement of hospital bylaws must be
tailored to the specific context and needs of the hospital, facilitating
appropriate medical practice and ethical conduct (Litvak et al.,
2020). However, non-compliance with these regulations can lead to
significant issues, such as compromised hospital reputation and
decreased quality of care, as evidenced by a study in Saudi Arabia
(Albrithen & Yalli, 2013).

To address gaps in the understanding and implementation of
hospital regulations, this article reviews literature published
between 2002 and 2023 on the enforcement and impact of hospital
bylaws in Indonesia. This period was selected because the
Indonesian Ministry of Health formalized internal hospital
regulations with the issuance of Decree No. 722/MENKES/SK/VI/2002. The review aims to shed light on the
effectiveness of these bylaws in improving hospital governance and
healthcare outcomes in Indonesia.

2. Material and Methods

This study employed a scoping review design to identify factors
influencing the implementation of hospital regulations in
Indonesia. Data were collected through a systematic search utilizing
two methods: systematic database searches and systematic manual
searches. The databases consulted included Science Direct, PubMed, and Google Scholar.

2.1 Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria:
The inclusion criteria for this study were research articles related to
the implementation of hospital bylaws in Indonesia, available as
free full-text articles, written in English or Indonesian, and focused
on hospitals in Indonesia. Additionally, the articles needed to be
published within the last 20 years (2003-2023). The exclusion
criteria eliminated articles that employed systematic review
methods or reviews and those that were not available for full access
(i.e., lacking full text). The selection and organization of articles
followed the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and
Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) protocol.
The selection process followed the Preferred Reporting Items for
Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) protocol.
Articles were screened according to the inclusion and exclusion
criteria, and were evaluated based on the review topic, objectives,
and review questions as outlined by Tricco et al. (2018).

2.2 Quality Assessment Method:
The quality of the articles was assessed using frequency counting
and content analysis, based on the methods of Arksey and O’Malley
(2005) and later adapted by the Joanna Briggs Institute. Critical
appraisal tools focused on two main aspects: the methodology of the
source articles and the presentation of research findings and results
(Glynn, 2006).

3. Results

Using the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and
Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) framework, we identified 2,492
potentially relevant articles from three databases: PubMed,
ScienceDirect, and Google Scholar. From these, 300 articles were
initially reviewed, leading to a closer examination of 15 articles.
Following quality assessment, two articles were excluded due to lack
of legal affiliation with hospitals, two were incomplete, and one was
a systematic review. Ultimately, 11 articles met the inclusion criteria
and were included in the synthesis presented in Table 1 and Figure
1.

The results of the literature review indicate that the articles
employed a variety of research instruments, including legal,
qualitative, and quantitative methodologies. These articles utilized
interviews, observations, documentation, and questionnaires to
explore the factors influencing the implementation of hospital
bylaws in Indonesia (Figure 2, Figure 3). Data collection was
grounded in applicable regulations and laws, such as director
regulations, resolutions, and technical details. Observations were
derived from hospital settings, while interviews provided in-depth
insights from owners, administrators, and physicians.

The analysis identified several key characteristics and factors
influencing the implementation of hospital bylaws. Respondents
included hospital owners, heads of health service departments,
hospital directors, commission doctors, general practitioners,
specialists, and other medical and auxiliary service representatives.

3.1 Factors in Implementation:

Owner Factor: In Lampung, hospital owners exhibited a lack of
knowledge and understanding of hospital laws, viewing regulations
primarily as tools for licensing and accreditation rather than
conflict resolution or policy development.

Director Factor: Research in Central Java revealed varying levels of
clinical management implementation, with 67% implementation of
clinical management, 75% completion of clinical management
structure, and 58% implementation of clinical management
processes. The Medical Commission’s tasks showed low
implementation rates in medical audits and accreditation but
higher rates in continuous professional development and support
for medical professionalism.

Medical Staff: Studies on patient safety highlighted mixed results.
While some nurses demonstrated good patient safety practices,
others were less capable. High workloads, especially during night
shifts, were noted as a challenge. At Ibnu Sina Hospital, patient
safety policies were well-implemented, reflecting the hospital’s
commitment to patient safety.

3.2 Patient Safety and Hospital Policy Implementation:
The implementation of patient safety protocols is critical for
hospital regulation adherence. Ensuring patient safety is an ongoing
priority and requires systematic updates to hospital policies.
Effective patient safety measures are integral to improving overall safety outcomes. Factors influencing the application of patient safety include management and organizational levels, such as transformational leadership, resource allocation, and regular audits of personnel and processes. Efficiency in patient safety policies, including risk evaluation, incident reporting, and management, contributes to minimizing errors and improving patient care.

The implementation of hospital bylaws in Indonesia is influenced by the knowledge and attitudes of hospital owners, the administrative capabilities of directors, and the patient safety practices of medical staff. The ongoing commitment to patient safety is vital for enhancing the overall effectiveness of hospital regulations.

According to the synthesis of the reviewed articles, factors influencing the implementation of hospital bylaws in Indonesia include the knowledge and understanding of hospital owners, the involvement of directors, and the engagement of medical staff. A significant finding from Lampung highlighted that hospital owners often lacked the necessary knowledge and understanding of hospital regulations, viewing them primarily as tools for licensing and accreditation purposes rather than for conflict resolution or policy development.

Directors played a critical role in implementing clinical management and supporting medical professionalism. Research by Manajemen Pelayanan Kesehatan et al. (2014) indicated a moderate to high level of clinical management implementation, with varying degrees of completion and process adherence.

Medical staff, particularly nurses, had a significant impact on patient safety, which in turn affected the implementation of hospital regulations. Sumarni (2017) noted that no respondents rated the implementation of patient safety practices as very poor, and Retno Yunita et al. (2016) found that 50.8% of nurses performed well in ensuring patient safety, although 49.2% faced challenges. Darliana (2016) identified that nurses' knowledge of patient safety was generally sufficient, yet the implementation efforts were categorized as poor by 43.3% of respondents. Additionally, the study found no significant relationship between nursing staff workloads and their performance in implementing patient safety policies during different shifts at Hasanuddin University Hospital.

Overall, patient safety emerged as a crucial factor influencing the implementation of hospital regulations. Effective hospital policy implementation requires a comprehensive patient safety program, focusing on continuous updates and improvements. At Ibn Sina Hospital, patient safety regulations were well-implemented, aligning with the hospital's vision to prioritize patient safety. This hospital demonstrated a structured approach to managing patient safety through a dedicated council responsible for overseeing the patient safety management system (Sumarni, 2017).

The literature review revealed that successful implementation of hospital bylaws involves multiple levels of management and organizational factors. Key elements include management’s perception and commitment to patient safety, transformational leadership, resource availability, safety committee leadership, transparency, and regular personnel and process audits. Efficient patient safety policies contribute to improved safety outcomes, emphasizing the importance of comprehensive strategies in hospital regulation implementation (Satria et al., n.d.). These findings underscore the multifaceted nature of hospital bylaw implementation, highlighting the interconnected roles of hospital owners, directors, and medical staff in ensuring effective and safe healthcare delivery in Indonesian hospitals.

4. Discussion

The implementation of hospital bylaws is a multifaceted process influenced by various stakeholders, including medical staff, hospital directors, and regulatory bodies. A crucial aspect of this process is the perception and role of medical staff, who often see themselves primarily as executors of policies rather than active participants in the development and long-term feasibility of hospital regulations (Murniati et al., 2016). Despite this perception, medical staff hold valuable insights into the practical aspects of implementing hospital orders, which can significantly impact patient safety outcomes and the overall effectiveness of hospital regulations.

Health personnel are required to communicate their opinions on medical practices to the hospital director via the chairman of the medical commission, in accordance with hospital regulations. The Medical Council plays a pivotal advisory role to the Director or Deputy Director of Medical Services concerning clinical services. This advisory function is critical as it does not impede any authority but ensures a balanced power dynamic among the involved authorities, thus fostering effective regulation (Muhammad Purnomo, 2010). A positive and collaborative relationship between medical staff and hospital management is fundamental for effectively expressing and addressing concerns related to hospital bylaws, which ultimately enhances patient safety (Zulham et al., 2022).

Patient safety implementation is a cornerstone of developing a robust patient safety program. Focusing on the practical aspects of patient safety implementation tends to yield better outcomes compared to merely having a patient safety program on paper (Sumarni, 2017). Building a culture of patient safety involves raising awareness about its importance, leading, and supporting staff in its implementation, which are critical steps outlined in PMK No. 1691 of 2011. The effective performance of patient safety measures directly correlates with the implementation of hospital bylaws, making it an essential component of healthcare management.
Table 1. Factors of Hospital Bylaws Implementation in each article

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Meaning of cle</th>
<th>Factors of Hospital Bylaws Implementation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>(Andriani, 2018)</td>
<td>Owner: Absence of Knowledge and awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>(Murniati, 2016)</td>
<td>Juridical: The existence of Minister of Health Regulation No: 755/MENKES/PER/IV/2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>(Purnomo, 2016)</td>
<td>Owner: The existence of monitoring Director: The existence of supervision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>(Sumarni, 2017)</td>
<td>Medical staff: The existence of patient safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>(Harati et al., 2014)</td>
<td>Director: Medical Committee Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>(Afandi et al., 2023)</td>
<td>Medical Staff: Guaranteed legal protection in accordance with Hospital Bylaws</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>(Yunita et al., 2016)</td>
<td>Medical Staff: Knowledge &amp; Commitment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>(Yusuf, 2017)</td>
<td>Medical staff: The existence of patient safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>(Darliana, 2016)</td>
<td>Medical staff: The existence of patient safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>(Satria et al., 2013)</td>
<td>Medical staff: The existence of Performance</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 1. Diagram of Prism

Figure 2. Mind map
Table 2. Question Implementation of Patient Safety

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Researcher</th>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sumarni, (2017)</td>
<td>Implementation Patient Safety:</td>
<td>n = 11 (0.49%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Weak</td>
<td>n = 39 (15.69%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Currently</td>
<td>n = 224 (71.57%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Strong</td>
<td>n = 30 (12.25%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. Very strong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yusuf (2017)</td>
<td>Implementation Patient Safety:</td>
<td>n = 30 (49.2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Not enough</td>
<td>n = 31 (50.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Good</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Darliana (2016)</td>
<td>Implementation Patient Safety by:</td>
<td>Implementation Good</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. Knowledge Good</td>
<td>n = 16 (25.9%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Knowledge Enough</td>
<td>n = 7 (10.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Lack of Knowledge</td>
<td>n = 1 (35.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Poor Implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>n = 9 (13.4%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>n = 22 (32.8%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>n = 12 (17.9%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Medical staff’s communication with the hospital director through the medical committee president is vital for conveying insights about medical activities that fall within the scope of hospital regulations. The medical committee advises the medical director/assistant director on clinical services, ensuring that non-functioning or problematic areas are addressed. The distinction in roles, responsibilities, and authorities among the various institutions involved is crucial for the effectiveness of hospital regulations (Muhammad Purnomo, 2010).

The performance of patient safety implementation is the result of individual or collective efforts to make patient care safer. This includes risk assessment, identification and management of patient-related risks, incident reporting and analysis, learning from incidents, and implementing solutions to minimize risk and prevent injuries. Hospital patient safety is a comprehensive system aimed at integrating patient safety into nursing care performance.

Factors affecting the performance of nurses in implementing patient safety are pivotal as they directly influence the overall safety outcomes. According to Gibson’s performance theory, performance is influenced by individual, psychological, and organizational variables. Furthermore, Griffiths highlights that nursing staff workloads are significant contributors to health problems within hospitals (Satria et al., n.d.).

In enhancing patient safety through the implementation of hospital bylaws, it is crucial to consider the personality traits of medical staff. A positive and proactive personality can significantly enhance patient safety measures, leading to effective implementation of hospital regulations. Hospital management can utilize tools such as the DISC Personality Test to assess and place healthcare providers appropriately based on their strengths and weaknesses (Aini et al., 2023). This strategic placement can optimize staff performance and contribute to a safer healthcare environment.

5. Conclusion

In conclusion, the successful implementation of hospital bylaws and patient safety measures hinges on the collaborative efforts of medical staff, hospital directors, and regulatory bodies. Building a culture of patient safety, fostering positive relationships among stakeholders, and strategically managing human resources are key elements in achieving effective hospital regulation and ensuring high standards of patient care. The insights and active participation of medical staff are invaluable in this process, making their engagement and feedback crucial for continuous improvement and safety in healthcare settings.

To achieve effective implementation of hospital bylaws, it is imperative for medical staff to enhance their performance, thereby ensuring optimal patient safety. Concurrently, hospital management must actively oversee the implementation of patient safety protocols and conduct regular re-evaluations to uphold regular standards.

This study provides valuable insights into the practices of medical staff in Indonesian hospitals, shedding light on the adherence to hospital bylaws. However, it is important to acknowledge that the findings are limited to the Indonesian context. Future research could benefit from exploring similar topics in diverse international settings to enrich our understanding and inform global best practices.

Exploring pertinent literature and engaging with ongoing research endeavors will be instrumental in shaping future studies on hospital management, particularly focusing on the effective implementation of hospital bylaws by medical staff. These efforts will contribute to advancing knowledge and addressing critical issues in healthcare governance and patient safety.

**Author contributions**

Z.N.D. designed the research proposals, conducted literature reviews, processed and visualized the data. Q.A. supervised and guided the interpretation of results and discussions, and finalized the research conclusions.

**Acknowledgment**

Author gratefully acknowledged Muhammadiyah University of Yogyakarta, Indonesia, and its Master of Hospital Administration program for their invaluable support and facilitation during the research process.

**Competing financial interests**

The authors have no conflict of interest.

**References**


